

## **TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY AFFAIRS**

www.tdhca.texas.gov

Greg Abbott GOVERNOR BOARD MEMBERS
Leo Vasquez, Chair
Kenny Marchant, Vice Chair
Cindy Conroy, Member
Anna Maria Farias, Member
Holland Harper, Member
Ajay Thomas, Member

March 14, 2025

Writer's direct phone # (512) 475 -3907 Email: Christina.Thompson@tdhca.texas.gov

Post Providence, LLC Los Angeles, California compliance@postinvestmentgroup.com

RE: Providence Uptown

Dear Post Providence, LLC:

The Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs (Department) has reviewed the Public Facility Corporation (PFC) Audit Report submitted by Novogradac & Company LLP on January 29, 2025. This review was performed as required by Section 303.042 (c) of Chapter 303, the Texas Administrative Code Chapter 10, Subchapter I, and the Regulatory Agreement/Deed Restriction for Providence Uptown.

Events of noncompliance have been identified and corrective action is required. The attached Findings Report details the event(s) of noncompliance and the required corrective action. This notice begins the corrective action period. Please supply all requested documentation no later than **May 13, 2025**, the last day of the corrective action period.

If clarification is necessary to complete the corrective action, contact us as soon as possible. If it is not possible to provide the requested documentation by the corrective action period, correct as much as you can and submit a corrective action plan detailing how and when the remaining issue(s) of noncompliance will be corrected.

The Department recommends submitting a cover letter explaining the documentation submitted to address each event of noncompliance. Submit corrective action to pfc.monitoring@tdhca.texas.gov.



If you have any questions about this monitoring report, please contact Christina Thompson toll free in Texas at (800) 643-8204, directly at (512) 475-3907, or email: christina.thompson@tdhca.texas.gov.

Sincerely,

Christina Thompson

**PFC Monitor** 

CC: Stephanie.Naquin@novoco.com

# **Audit Report**

## Providence Uptown

The Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs provides the following Technical Assistance:

• Development is required to obtain, complete and maintain on file Income Certifications from each Low-Income Household, including (i) the Income Certification provided as Exhibit D, attached hereto and incorporated herein, dated prior to the initial occupancy of such Low-Income Household in the Project that occupied the unit. The file sample revealed one (1) household files where the income certification was dated after the occupancy date. Ensure initial Income Certifications are completed prior to initial occupancy in accordance with Section 3(c) of the Regulatory Agreement to maintain compliance.

#### TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY AFFAIRS

# DETAIL FINDINGS AND CORRECTIVE ACTION PFC PROGRAM

PFC User: Post Providence, LLC

Property Name: Providence Uptown Audit Report Date: 1/22/2025

Address: 3323 McCue Rd, Houston, TX 77056 Program: PFC

RA Date: 10/11/2022

Corrective Action Due Date: 5/13/2025

Audit Report Review Date: 3/5/2025

PROGRAM: PFC

#### PROPERTY FINDINGS

Unit # 1-124

Finding Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date 12/5/2022 Correction Date:

Reason Annualizing the average of the most recent paystubs for the household resulted in the household's annual gross income of \$50,745.76, which

exceeds the applicable 60% AMI income limit of \$39,720.

Corrective Action To correct, designate unit 1-124 to an 80% AMI unit since their income exceeds the 60% AMI limit and lease the next available unit of comparable or

smaller size to a household that income qualifies at the 60% AMI limit. Owner may survey existing vacant non-program units to replace unit 1-124 and reserve as a program-unit to be occupied with a household that income qualifies at 60% AMI. Submit documentation to the Department that the unit is vacant and a statement that it is reserved to be occupied by a Low-Income Household. Or if the household's circumstances have changed, the owner may certify them under current circumstances using current income limits. If verifying under current circumstances, submit a copy of the

household file, application, verification of income and assets, executed Income Certification and lease agreement.

Unit # 3-314

Finding Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date 2/17/2023 Correction Date:

Reason Annualizing the average of the most recent paystubs for the household resulted in the household's annual gross income of \$41,584.92, which

exceeds the applicable 60% AMI income limit of \$39,720.

To correct, designate unit 3-314 to an 80% AMI unit since their income exceeds the 60% AMI limit and lease the next available unit of comparable or smaller size to a household that income qualifies at the 60% AMI limit. Owner may survey existing vacant non-program units to replace unit 3-314 and reserve as a program-unit to be occupied with a household that income qualifies at 60% AMI. Submit documentation to the Department that the unit is vacant and a statement that it is reserved to be occupied by a Low-Income Household. Or if the household's circumstances have changed, the owner may certify them under current circumstances using current income limits. If verifying under current circumstances, submit a copy of the household file, application, verification of income and assets, executed Income Certification and lease agreement.

Unit # 19-1914

Finding Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date 6/1/2023 Correction Date:

Reason Annualizing the average of the most recent paystubs for the household resulted in the household's annual gross income of \$64,573.08, which

exceeds the applicable 60% AMI income limit of \$51,060.

Corrective Action

To correct, designate unit 19-1914 to an 80% AMI unit since their income exceeds the 60% AMI limit and lease the next available unit of comparable or smaller size to a household that income qualifies at the 60% AMI limit. Owner may survey existing vacant non-program units to replace unit 19-1914 and reserve as a program-unit to be occupied with a household that income qualifies at 60% AMI. Submit documentation to the Department that the unit is vacant and a statement that it is reserved to be occupied by a Low-Income Household. Or if the household's circumstances have changed, the owner may certify them under current circumstances using current income limits. If verifying under current circumstances, submit a

copy of the household file, application, verification of income and assets, executed Income Certification and lease agreement.

Unit # 3-343

Finding Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date 5/11/2023 Correction Date:

Reason Annualizing the average of the most recent paystubs for the household resulted in the household's annual gross income of \$70,828.16, which

exceeds the applicable 80% AMI income limit of \$50,480.

Corrective Action

To correct, designate unit 3-343 to an non-program unit since their income exceeds the 80% AMI limit and lease the next available unit of comparable or smaller size to a household that income qualifies at the 80% AMI limit. Owner may survey existing vacant non-program units to

replace unit 3-343 and reserve as a program-unit to be occupied with a household that income qualifies at 80% AMI. Submit documentation to the Department that the unit is vacant and a statement that it is reserved to be occupied by a Low-Income Household. Or if the household's circumstances have changed, the owner may certify them under current circumstances using current income limits. If verifying under current circumstances, submit a copy of the household file, application, verification of income and assets, executed Income Certification and lease

agreement.

Unit # 4-411

Finding Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date 4/28/2023 Correction Date:

Reason Annualizing the average of the most recent paystubs for the household resulted in the household's annual gross income of \$77,200.24, which

exceeds the applicable 80% AMI income limit of \$60,560.

To correct, designate unit 4-411 to an non-program unit since their income exceeds the 80% AMI limit and lease the next available unit of comparable or smaller size to a household that income qualifies at the 80% AMI limit. Owner may survey existing vacant non-program units to replace unit 4-411 and reserve as a program-unit to be occupied with a household that income qualifies at 80% AMI. Submit documentation to the Department that the unit is vacant and a statement that it is reserved to be occupied by a Low-Income Household. Or if the household's circumstances have changed, the owner may certify them under current circumstances using current income limits. If verifying under current circumstances, submit a copy of the household file, application, verification of income and assets, executed Income Certification and lease agreement.

Unit # 5-513

Corrective Action

Finding Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date 12/8/2023 Correction Date:

Reason Annualizing the average of the most recent paystubs for the household resulted in the household's annual gross income of \$68,508.44, which

exceeds the applicable 80% AMI income limit of \$68,080.

To correct, designate unit 5-513 to an non-program unit since their income exceeds the 80% AMI limit and lease the next available unit of comparable or smaller size to a household that income qualifies at the 80% AMI limit. Owner may survey existing vacant non-program units to replace unit 5-513 and reserve as a program-unit to be occupied with a household that income qualifies at 80% AMI. Submit documentation to the Department that the unit is vacant and a statement that it is reserved to be occupied by a Low-Income Household. Or if the household's circumstances have changed, the owner may certify them under current circumstances using current income limits. If verifying under current circumstances, submit a copy of the household file, application, verification of income and assets, executed Income Certification and lease agreement.

Unit # 7-743

Finding Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date 12/23/2023 Correction Date:

Reason Annualizing the average of the most recent paystubs for the household resulted in the household's annual gross income of \$53,966.90, which

exceeds the applicable 80% AMI income limit of \$52,960.

Corrective Action To correct, designate unit 7-743 to an non-program unit since their income exceeds the 80% AMI limit and lease the next available unit of

comparable or smaller size to a household that income qualifies at the 80% AMI limit. Owner may survey existing vacant non-program units to replace unit 7-743 and reserve as a program-unit to be occupied with a household that income qualifies at 80% AMI. Submit documentation to the Department that the unit is vacant and a statement that it is reserved to be occupied by a Low-Income Household. Or if the household's circumstances have changed, the owner may certify them under current circumstances using current income limits. If verifying under current circumstances, submit a copy of the household file, application, verification of income and assets, executed Income Certification and lease

agreement.

Unit # 10-1034

Reason

Finding Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date 5/12/2023 Correction Date:

Annualizing the average of the most recent paystubs for the household resulted in the household's annual gross income of \$97,054.36, which

exceeds the applicable 80% AMI income limit of \$60,560.

To correct, designate unit 10-1034 to an non-program unit since their income exceeds the 80% AMI limit and lease the next available unit of comparable or smaller size to a household that income qualifies at the 80% AMI limit. Owner may survey existing vacant non-program units to replace unit 10-1034 and reserve as a program-unit to be occupied with a household that income qualifies at 80% AMI. Submit documentation to the Department that the unit is vacant and a statement that it is reserved to be occupied by a Low-Income Household. Or if the household's circumstances have changed, the owner may certify them under current circumstances using current income limits. If verifying under current circumstances, submit a copy of the household file, application, verification of income and assets, executed Income Certification and lease agreement.

Unit # 14-1411

Finding

Reason

Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date

Annualizing the average of the most recent paystubs for the household resulted in the household's annual gross income of \$\_ , which exceeds the applicable 80% AMI income limit of \$ .

Corrective Action

To correct, designate unit XXX to an non-program unit since their income exceeds the 80% AMI limit and lease the next available unit of comparable or smaller size to a household that income qualifies at the 80% AMI limit. Owner may survey existing vacant non-program units to replace unit XXX and reserve as a program-unit to be occupied with a household that income qualifies at 80% AMI. Submit documentation to the Department that the unit is vacant and a statement that it is reserved to be occupied by a Low-Income Household. Or if the household's circumstances have changed, the owner may certify them under current circumstances using current income limits. If verifying under current circumstances, submit a copy of the household file, application, verification of income and assets, executed Income Certification and lease agreement.

Unit # 14-1413

Finding

Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date

8/8/2023 Correction Date:

Reason

Annualizing the average of the most recent paystubs for the household resulted in the household's annual gross income of \$128,502.32, which exceeds the applicable 80% AMI income limit of \$52,960.

Corrective Action

To correct, designate unit 14-1413 to an non-program unit since their income exceeds the 80% AMI limit and lease the next available unit of comparable or smaller size to a household that income qualifies at the 80% AMI limit. Owner may survey existing vacant non-program units to replace unit 14-1413 and reserve as a program-unit to be occupied with a household that income qualifies at 80% AMI. Submit documentation to the Department that the unit is vacant and a statement that it is reserved to be occupied by a Low-Income Household. Or if the household's circumstances have changed, the owner may certify them under current circumstances using current income limits. If verifying under current circumstances, submit a copy of the household file, application, verification of income and assets, executed Income Certification and lease agreement.

Unit # 15-1543

Finding Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date 11/20/2024

Correction Date:

Correction Date:

Reason

Third party employment verification reflects the household's annual gross income of \$150,000, which exceeds the applicable 80% AMI income limit of \$52,960.

To correct, designate unit 15-1543 to an non-program unit since their income exceeds the 80% AMI limit and lease the next available unit of comparable or smaller size to a household that income qualifies at the 80% AMI limit. Owner may survey existing vacant non-program units to replace unit 15-1543 and reserve as a program-unit to be occupied with a household that income qualifies at 80% AMI. Submit documentation to the Department that the unit is vacant and a statement that it is reserved to be occupied by a Low-Income Household. Or if the household's circumstances have changed, the owner may certify them under current circumstances using current income limits. If verifying under current circumstances, submit a copy of the household file, application, verification of income and assets, executed Income Certification and lease agreement.

Unit # 19-1922

Finding Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date 12/1/2023 Correction Date:

Reason Third party employment verification reflects the household's annual gross income of \$54,000, which exceeds the applicable 80% AMI income limit of

\$52,960.

Corrective Action

To correct, designate unit 19-1922 to an non-program unit since their income exceeds the 80% AMI limit and lease the next available unit of comparable or smaller size to a household that income qualifies at the 80% AMI limit. Owner may survey existing vacant non-program units to replace unit 19-1922 and reserve as a program-unit to be occupied with a household that income qualifies at 80% AMI. Submit documentation to the Department that the unit is vacant and a statement that it is reserved to be occupied by a Low-Income Household. Or if the household's circumstances have changed, the owner may certify them under current circumstances using current income limits. If verifying under current circumstances, submit a copy of the household file, application, verification of income and assets, executed Income Certification and lease agreement.

Unit # 8-845

Finding Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date

110110011plianeo Bato

Reason

3/1/2023 Correction Date:

In accordance with Section 3(c) of the Regulatory Agreement, the following items are acceptable to determine income eligibility: (1) pay stubs for the most recent four-week period; (2) income tax returns for the most recent two tax years; (3) an income verification from the applicant's current employer; (4) an income verification from the Social Security Administration; or (5) if applicant is unemployed, does not have tax returns or is otherwise unable to provide other forms of verification as required, another form of independent verification as would be satisfactory.

Tenant file contained 2023 tax return. For this income verification type, two years of tax returns is required per the Development's Regulatory Agreement. The Auditor reported the income could not be determined or verified.

Corrective Action

The owner may complete a retroactive income certification that completely and clearly documents the sources of income/assets for all household members that were in place at the time of the initial certification and apply income limits that were in effect on the initial move-in date. Submit for Department review a copy of the application(s), income/asset verifications and a new Income Certification form that clearly documents all sources of income/assets at the time of move-in. Or the owner has the option to complete a new current certification using current income/assets sources and current income limits. Submit for Department review a copy of the application(s), income/asset verifications and a new Income Certification form that clearly documents all current sources of income/assets. If the household has moved out or is not income eligible, occupy the unit or another comparable unit on the property with a new income eligible household. Submit copies of the application(s), income/asset verifications, an Income Certification, lease contract and applicable lease addendums to the Department for review

Finding

Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date

4/14/2023

Reason

In accordance with Section 3(c) of the Regulatory Agreement, the following items are acceptable to determine income eligibility: (1) pay stubs for the most recent four-week period; (2) income tax returns for the most recent two tax years; (3) an income verification from the applicant's current employer; (4) an income verification from the Social Security Administration; or (5) if applicant is unemployed, does not have tax returns or is otherwise unable to provide other forms of verification as required, another form of independent verification as would be satisfactory.

Tenant file contained 2023 tax return. For this income verification type, two years of tax returns is required per the Development's Regulatory Agreement. The Auditor reported the income could not be determined or verified.

Corrective Action

The owner may complete a retroactive income certification that completely and clearly documents the sources of income/assets for all household members that were in place at the time of the initial certification and apply income limits that were in effect on the initial move-in date. Submit for Department review a copy of the application(s), income/asset verifications and a new Income Certification form that clearly documents all sources of income/assets at the time of move-in. Or the owner has the option to complete a new current certification using current income/assets sources and current income limits. Submit for Department review a copy of the application(s), income/asset verifications and a new Income Certification form that clearly documents all current sources of income/assets. If the household has moved out or is not income eligible, occupy the unit or another comparable unit on the property with a new income eligible household. Submit copies of the application(s), income/asset verifications, an Income Certification, lease contract and applicable lease addendums to the Department for review

Unit # 12-1225

Finding Noncompliance Date

10/23/2023

Reason

Household above the income limit

In accordance with Section 3(c) of the Regulatory Agreement, the following items are acceptable to determine income eligibility: (1) pay stubs for the most recent four-week period; (2) income tax returns for the most recent two tax years; (3) an income verification from the applicant's current employer; (4) an income verification from the Social Security Administration; or (5) if applicant is unemployed, does not have tax returns or is otherwise unable to provide other forms of verification as required, another form of independent verification as would be satisfactory.

Tenant file contained 2023 W2 statement. For this income verification type, two years of tax returns is required per the Development's Regulatory Agreement. The Auditor reported the income could not be determined or verified.

Corrective Action

The owner may complete a retroactive income certification that completely and clearly documents the sources of income/assets for all household members that were in place at the time of the initial certification and apply income limits that were in effect on the initial move-in date. Submit for Department review a copy of the application(s), income/asset verifications and a new Income Certification form that clearly documents all sources of income/assets at the time of move-in. Or the owner has the option to complete a new current certification using current income/assets sources and current income limits. Submit for Department review a copy of the application(s), income/asset verifications and a new Income Certification form that clearly documents all current sources of income/assets. If the household has moved out or is not income eligible, occupy the unit or another comparable unit on the property with a new income eligible household. Submit copies of the application(s), income/asset verifications, an Income Certification, lease contract and applicable lease addendums to the Department for review

Unit # 15-1544

Finding

Household above the income limit 5/19/2023

Noncompliance Date

Correction Date:

Correction Date:

Correction Date:

Reason

In accordance with Section 3(c) of the Regulatory Agreement, the following items are acceptable to determine income eligibility: (1) pay stubs for the most recent four-week period; (2) income tax returns for the most recent two tax years; (3) an income verification from the applicant's current employer; (4) an income verification from the Social Security Administration; or (5) if applicant is unemployed, does not have tax returns or is otherwise unable to provide other forms of verification as required, another form of independent verification as would be satisfactory.

Auditor reports tenant file does not contain any income verification documents and income cannot be determined or verified.

Corrective Action

The owner may complete a retroactive income certification that completely and clearly documents the sources of income/assets for all household members that were in place at the time of the initial certification and apply income limits that were in effect on the initial move-in date. Submit for Department review a copy of the application(s), income/asset verifications and a new Income Certification form that clearly documents all sources of income/assets at the time of move-in. Or the owner has the option to complete a new current certification using current income/assets sources and current income limits. Submit for Department review a copy of the application(s), income/asset verifications and a new Income Certification form that clearly documents all current sources of income/assets. If the household has moved out or is not income eligible, occupy the unit or another comparable unit on the property with a new income eligible household. Submit copies of the application(s), income/asset verifications, an Income Certification, lease contract and applicable lease addendums to the Department for review

Unit # 20-2038

Finding Household above the income limit

Noncompliance Date 5/28/2023 Correction Date:

Reason

In accordance with Section 3(c) of the Regulatory Agreement, the following items are acceptable to determine income eligibility: (1) pay stubs for the most recent four-week period; (2) income tax returns for the most recent two tax years; (3) an income verification from the applicant's current employer; (4) an income verification from the Social Security Administration; or (5) if applicant is unemployed, does not have tax returns or is otherwise unable to provide other forms of verification as required, another form of independent verification as would be satisfactory.

Auditor reports tenant file does not contain any acceptable forms of income verification documents and income cannot be determined or verified.

Corrective Action

The owner may complete a retroactive income certification that completely and clearly documents the sources of income/assets for all household members that were in place at the time of the initial certification and apply income limits that were in effect on the initial move-in date. Submit for Department review a copy of the application(s), income/asset verifications and a new Income Certification form that clearly documents all sources of income/assets at the time of move-in. Or the owner has the option to complete a new current certification using current income/assets sources and current income limits. Submit for Department review a copy of the application(s), income/asset verifications and a new Income Certification form that clearly documents all current sources of income/assets. If the household has moved out or is not income eligible, occupy the unit or another comparable unit on the property with a new income eligible household. Submit copies of the application(s), income/asset verifications, an Income Certification, lease contract and applicable lease addendums to the Department for review

Unit # 1-144

Finding Gross rent exceeds the highest rent allowed under the Regulatory Agreement

Noncompliance Date 12/20/2022 Correction Date:

Reason Unit # 1-144 is designated as 60% AMI. The household's rent of \$1,148 exceeds the 60% AMI rent limit of \$1,135.

To correct, reduce the household's rent to \$1,135 per month. Calculate the rent overage from the time of move-in, and either refund or credit the household the overpaid rent. Submit the follow documentation for review: the rent overage calculation, an amended lease contract reflecting the new rent amount, the household's rent ledger of the new rent amount reflected and the rent credit (if applicable) or a copy of the cancelled check (if a refund is issued).

Unit # 9-931

Finding
Noncompliance Date

Gross rent exceeds the highest rent allowed under the Regulatory Agreement 4/14/2023

Reason

Unit #9-931 is designated as 60% AMI. The household's rent of \$1,666 exceeds the 60% AMI rent limit of \$1,216.

Corrective Action

To correct, reduce the household's rent to \$1,216 per month. Calculate the rent overage from the time of move-in, and either refund or credit the household the overpaid rent. Submit the follow documentation for review: the rent overage calculation, an amended lease contract reflecting the new rent amount, the household's rent ledger of the new rent amount reflected and the rent credit (if applicable) or a copy of the cancelled check (if a refund is issued).

Unit # 15-1544

Finding

Gross rent exceeds the highest rent allowed under the Regulatory Agreement

Noncompliance Date

5/19/2023

Correction Date:

Correction Date:

Reason Unit # 15-1544 is designated as 60% AMI. The household's rent of \$1,543 exceeds the 60% AMI rent limit of \$1,276.

Corrective Action

To correct, reduce the household's rent to \$1,276 per month. Calculate the rent overage from the time of move-in, and either refund or credit the household the overpaid rent. Submit the follow documentation for review: the rent overage calculation, an amended lease contract reflecting the new rent amount, the household's rent ledger of the new rent amount reflected and the rent credit (if applicable) or a copy of the cancelled check (if a refund is issued).

Unit # 10-1042

Reason

Finding

Failure to comply with the Public Facility Corporation Regulatory Agreement

Noncompliance Date

11/10/2023

Correction Date:

Development is required to obtain, complete and maintain on file Income Certifications from each Low-Income Household, including (i) the Income Certification provided as Exhibit D, attached hereto and incorporated herein, dated prior to the initial occupancy of such Low-Income Household in the Project that occupied the unit.

Tenant file does not contain an executed copy of the required Exhibit D Income Certification form, required by the Development's Regulatory Agreement.

Corrective Action

Provide the household with the completed Exhibit D Income Certification for execution. Do not backdate. Submit the Department a copy of the executed Exhibit D Income Certification for review.