# TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY AFFAIRS

## An Internal Audit of the Multifamily Asset Management Division Amendments and Constructions Status Reports functions Audit Report #24-003

#### Executive Summary

all of which have been detailed in the final audit report. appear to be operating effectively. The auditor has identified the following areas that necessitate improvement, and regulations. Based on our review and testing, the Amendments and Construction Status Reports functions audit standards and included the objectives to review, assess, and evaluate for compliance with applicable rules functions of the Multifamily Asset Management Division. This audit was conducted in accordance with applicable The Office of Internal Audit (OIA) performed an audit of the Amendments and Construction Status Reports

## **Observations and Recommendations**

not yet available for the required initial construction status report. developments may not need to provide AIA G702 and G703 and construction inspection forms if they are IA recommends that a note be made in the post-award activities manual that states that 4% HTC

#### Management Response

Management agreed with our recommendations, and detailed response is included in the body of the report

## Objective, Scope and Methodology

on the TDHCA website for the past 1 year of operation—from January 2023 to the current date. amendments, data regarding construction status reports provided by the division, board books, and materials found Qualified Allocation Plan<sup>3</sup>, relevant federal code<sup>4</sup>, data collected by the division on completed and/or pending Our scope included a review of related Texas Administrative Codes<sup>1</sup>, relevant Texas Government Codes<sup>2</sup>, the

Mark Scott, CPA, CIA, CISA, CFE, MBA

Director, Internal Audit

129/24

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> TAC Chapter 10 Subchapter E; Chapter 10 Subchapter C, Rule §11.207

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Texas Code §2306.6731, §2306.6726, §2306.6725 The 2023 and 2024 version

Federal Code §42



## TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY AFFAIRS

www.tdhca.texas.gov

Greg Abbott
Governor

BOARD MEMBERS
Leo Vasquez, Chair
Kenny Marchant, Vice Chair
Cindy Conroy, Member
Anna Maria Farías, Member
Holland Harper, Member
Ajay Thomas, Member

May 29, 2024

Writer's direct phone # 512.475.3813
Email: mark.scott@tdhca.texas.gov

Board Members of the Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs ("TDHCA")

RE: Constructions Status Reports functions Internal Audit of the Multifamily Asset Management Division **Amendments** and

#### **Dear Board Members:**

compliance with applicable rules and regulations. review, assess, and evaluate the Amendments and Construction Status Reports functions for was conducted in accordance with applicable audit standards and included the objectives to Asset Management Division Amendments & Constructions Status Reports functions". This audit This report presents the results of the Office of Internal Audit ("OIA") "Audit of the Multifamily

state of the construction process. Three specific functions of the division were chosen for an function was addressed in a prior audit report audit: amendments, construction status reports, and ownership transfers. This report addresses lack of prior audits, as well as its importance in ensuring proper processes and approval for each The Multifamily Asset Management Division rated high on the annual risk assessment due to a Amendments and Construction Status Reports functions only—the ownership transfer

This report includes the following sections:

- A. Overall Result
- B. Background
- C. Scope and Methodology
- D. Roles and Responsibilities
- Testing and Recommendations

#### A. Overall Results

appear to be operating effectively. The auditor has identified one recommended area for improvement. Based on our review and testing, the Amendments and Construction Status Reports functions

#### B. Background

developments. This Division handles both amendments and construction status reports. documents to minimize exposure to the Department and ensure long term financial viability of properties. The Asset Management team operates in a proactive manner by enforcing regulatory Asset Management is responsible for development-performance oversight for all multifamily

purposes only. The requirements governing these amendments types can be found in the Texas minor changes and do not require department approval- they are typically noted for information to a development and are approved administratively within the division. Notifications are very waivers are considered major changes to an agreement and typically are brought before the different types: material, non-material, waivers, and notifications. Material amendment and purview of the Asset Management team. Amendments can be broken down further into four direct loan amendments are processed by staff in the Direct Loan division and is not under the amendments, and amendments to the Land Use Restriction Agreement (LURA). The Asset Amendments can be split into three different distinctions: application amendments, direct loan Management team to streamline the amendment process for all developments. administrative code and the post-award activities manual, a guide created by the Asset TDHCA board for final approval. Non-material amendments typically involve more minor changes Management division is responsible for overseeing both application and LURA amendments—

rehabilitation of a development. This requirement is not identified in statute and is only specified to the rules to provide the Department the ability to track the progress of construction and in the Asset Management rules. Developments must supply these reports by each quarter's end. Management and Texas Administrative code rules in 2013. The reporting requirement was added Regular construction status reports for developments was added as a requirement to the Asset Delinquent reports without a prior approved extension by the division incur a fee that must be

required for all multifamily developments, regardless of the funding source paid prior to the issuance of IRS forms 8609. Submission of a Construction Status Report is

### Scope and Methodology

operation—from January 2023 to the current date. the division, board books, and materials found on the TDHCA website for the past 1 year of completed and/or pending amendments, data regarding construction status reports provided by Codes<sup>2</sup>, the Qualified Allocation Plan<sup>3</sup>, relevant federal code<sup>4</sup>, data collected by the division on Our scope included a review of related Texas Administrative Codes<sup>1</sup>, relevant Texas Government

## D. Roles and Responsibilities

with their assignments as needed. originating from their assigned area; however, other Asset Managers may assist other managers in Texas. Each Asset Manager handles amendment requests and construction status reports workload is divided amongst eight Asset Managers, all of which are assigned a geographical area Director of Multifamily Asset Management. The amendment and construction status report **DIVISION STAFF:** The amendment and construction status report processes are supervised by the

executed. In many cases, the Director of Asset Management acts as designee for the Executive for approval. Non-material amendments are typically routed to the Director of Asset Use Restriction Agreement (LURA), the Asset Manager will prepare and submit to the Division's Executive Director for approval. If the approved amendment requires an amendment to the Land route them to the Deputy Executive Director, Director of External Affairs, the Legal Division, and amendments, Asset Managers prepare a Board Action Request (BAR) for consideration by the a material amendments, non-material amendment, a waiver, and a notification. For material Director to approve non-material amendments. Notifications do not require department Management and the Executive Director for approval, and do not require board approval to be Director a Loan Document Routing Request form, which is then routed to the Legal Department board for approval. Once prepared, the Division's Director will begin reviewing the BARs and The Texas Administrative Code and Post-Award Activity manual clearly define what is considered

submitted the required reports or if a report is incomplete. issues arise. Asset Managers will attempt to contact Developments Owners that have not Owners' responsibility to comply with the reporting requirements specified in the rules, including The status reports are reviewed by asset managers and escalated as needed to management if Construction status reports require no additional approval outside of general Director oversight. However, it is the Development

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> TAC Chapter 10 Subchapter E; Chapter 10 Subchapter C, Rule §11.207 <sup>2</sup> Texas Code §2306.6731, §2306.6726, §2306.6725

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The 2023 and 2024 version

the report dates entered into the database to confirm that required extension fees were paid or adhering to the specified deadlines. Missing deadlines incurs a fee. Asset Managers will review construction stats reports are required to be settled prior to the issuance of IRS Forms 8609. outstanding prior to routing a cost certification for approval. All outstanding fees regarding

entities and natural persons involved in the Developments. These entities can be for-profit PARTICIPANTS: The participants in the amendments and construction status reports are the corporations or non-profit entities.

## E. Testing and Recommendations

that if this is intended to be a rare amendment, not including it in the post-activities manual not expected to continue into the future. The auditor acknowledges this challenge, and agrees requests from developers lately, this is due to specific circumstances within the industry and are developments under extraordinary circumstances. Although there has been an uptick in waiver purposefully excluded because they are intended to be very rare exceptions made for appearing in the TAC. The Director of Asset Management stated that instructions on waivers were pursue the majority of amendment types, waivers are not included, despite instructions appears that although the post-award activities guide contains detailed instructions on how to whether division processes adhered to code stipulations and that all materials are consistent. It amendments and construction status reports functions. The purpose of this test was to review code, and federal code with internal manuals and guides provided by the division for the amendments and construction status reports were identified. recommendation appears to The auditor began the review by cross-referencing Texas government code, Texas administrative be justified. Therefore, this discrepancy is noted as an observation and was issued. 8 additional discrepancies regarding the processing 으

specified in supporting documentation. No gaps in documentation were identified by the auditor. was used as parameters for testing. Beyond this, the requirements for each type of amendment testing pool. All types of amendments require a fee and letter of explanation—this requirement Next, testing was conducted on application amendments received by the division. Testing was varies; therefore, testing parameters were tailored to each specific amendment type and is material amendment, waiver, material amendment, and notification-- were included in the conducted using specific sampling to ensure that all types of application amendments—non-

further inquiry, all the necessary paperwork was identified. Additionally, it was noted that the fee and letter of explanation were used as testing parameters. According to testing and amendment requests can vary based on the individual circumstances of the development, only sample. Developments are required to submit a fee as well as a letter of explanation for the amendments to the Right of First Refusal clause comprised roughly 30% of the amendment request for a change—however, as these documents are not technically required and amendment that they seek. Additional documents are also typically submitted to support the Further testing was conducted on LURA amendments. Testing was conducted using a randomized

division had plans later this year to clarify these types of LURA amendments in guides and types of documentation needed for approval by the division. The Director indicated that the rules. Despite this being a relatively common request, there was no specific guidance for the request usually originates from older developments wishing to update this clause to current requests—statue changed the length of time of ROFR from 2 years to 180 days. The amendment a recommendation. manuals provided to developments. As a result, this is being noted as an observations and not as

that these documents are commonly not available for 4% HTC developments this early in the it was discovered that although documents state that AIA G702 and G703 and construction a result. The auditor finds this exception acceptable and is noting it as an observation only. Lastly, auditor finds this solution acceptable and is noting it as an observation only. The next gap instructed by the division to provide the signed form in future construction status reports. The development had provided additional paperwork that meets the requirement, and was signed minority owned business report. Upon further review, it was discovered documentation were identified. The first discrepancy is that a development did not provide a indicating substantial completion, or final AIA documents G702 or G703 forms. Three gaps in until construction is complete as evidenced by a certificate of occupancy, AIA G04 documents minority owned business reports be filed. These reports are required to be submitted quarterly reports. Subsequent reports only require that AIA G702 and G703 forms, inspection reports, and Architecture (AIA) G702 and G703 forms, inspection reports, and minority owned business partnership agreements, construction contracts, loan agreements, the American Institute of are required to send in documents quarterly to demonstrate construction progress. The initial report (CSR) requirements. All multifamily housing developments currently under construction construction process. The auditor has issued recommendation pertaining to this finding, which inspection forms are required to be submitted with initial construction status reports, it appears particular development was facing construction delays and no report was able to be provided as identified was a missing inspection report. The Director explained to the auditor that that report from brand new developments require more paperwork than subsequent reports: Lastly, testing was also conducted on documents received to satisfy quarterly construction status can be found below:

		Target	
Observation Number	Status Pertaining to the Recommendations and Action to be Taken	Completion Date	Responsible Party
24-003.01	IA recommends that a note be made in the post-award 9/1/2024	9/1/2024	Lee Ann
	activities manual that states that 4% HTC		Chance
	developments may not need to provide AIA G702 and		
	G703 and construction inspection forms if they are not		
	yet available for the required initial construction status		
	report.		

#### Management Response:

The Post Award Activities Manual will be revised to add the note recommended by IA.

and assistance during the course of this audit. OIA extends our appreciation to the Asset Management Division and staff for their cooperation

Mark Scott, CPA, CIA, CISA, CFE, MBA

Internal Audit Director

MS/MM

Report # 24-003

